

Message

To: Jarnail A Singh [mailto:] GRO
CC: Andy Cash [/O=CARTWRIGHT KING/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=Andy Cash65]
Subject: RE: Horizon (Wylie 21392)

Jarnail,

I would have preferred someone entirely independant but this is such a specialist area that we would be hard pushed to get a report in the timescale that we require - we might open our expert up to allegations of partiality but his expertise will be unlikely to be challenged.

We need to get this report off the skids as soon as possible as we have PCMHs and trials galloping up on us.

You should have my advice of July but should you want further input as to general content please get in touch

Harry

From: Jarnail A Singh [mailto:] GRO
Sent: 12 September 2012 15:36
To: Andy Cash
Cc: Hugh Flemington; Andrew Bolc; martin smith; Harry Bowyer
Subject: RE: Horizon

Andy

Thinking about choice of expert in this case. I have in the past instructed Gareth Jenkins of Fujitsu in the case of Misra which incidental was the only challenge on Horizon ,he provided expertise in dealing with defences bound less enquiry into the whole Horizon system. Perhaps we need to reconsider whether to instruct him as he may be viewed too close to the system but instruct

Somebody entirely independent? Your thoughts please and also whether you or Harry have anybody in mind.

Thank you.

Jarnail

From: Andy Cash [mailto:] GRO
Sent: 12 September 2012 08:38
To: Jarnail A Singh
Cc: Hugh Flemington; Andrew Bolc; martin smith; Harry Bowyer
Subject: RE: Horizon

Jarnail,

Harry advises that the report, provided it is comprehensive, is what is needed and we now need the experts report on it as soon as practicable in view of the current cases timetables.

Please let me know what timescale is expected when you ascertain it

Andy

From: Jarnail A Singh [mailto:] GRO
Sent: 11 September 2012 13:38
To: Andy Cash; Andrew Bolc
Cc: Hugh Flemington
Subject: FW: Horizon

Andy/Andrew

Please see Helen Rose disclosures final draft report on her analysis of Horizon cases.

I look forward to receiving your comments before forwarding the data for an expert report.

Regards

jarnail

From: Helen Rose
Sent: 07 September 2012 12:11
To: Jarnail A Singh
Cc: Andy Hayward
Subject: FW: Horizon

Hi Jarnail

Could you confirm for me that you would like this report sending out please. I will continue to build on the spreadsheet as cases arise and keep you updated with this piece of ongoing work.

regards

Helen Rose

Security Team

GRO

Mobile: GRO Mobex: GRO

From: Helen Rose
Sent: 31 August 2012 10:35
To: Jarnail A Singh
Subject: RE: Horizon

Morning Jarnail

I have included a bit more information in the report regarding what has been requested by the defence. (or what I am understanding what has been requested). Generally it tends to be training procedures and operating processes around where ever the loss was challenged. Misra appears to be the only one that has challenged the more technical areas with fujitsu, which was covered by Gareth Jenkins at the trial. Some of the challenges are requesting information on previous challenges but these seem to be a general request rather than anything consistent.

regards

Helen Rose

Security Team

GRO

GRO

Mobile:

GRO

Mobex:

GRO

From: Jarnail A Singh
Sent: 28 August 2012 14:06
To: Helen Rose
Subject: RE: Horizon

Thanks Helen. If you have come across defence expert reports and defence statements requesting operating data of Horizon you should include this as part of the enclosures in your report.

Regards
Jarnail

From: Helen Rose
Sent: 28 August 2012 12:13
To: Jarnail A Singh
Subject: FW: Horizon

Hi Jarnail

Could you please confirm if you are happy with this document and I will circulate to my line manger, Dave Pardoe, Andy Hayward and John Scott.

I will continue to monitor / update the working spreadsheet and this can be amended accordingly as we build up our information.

Many thanks.

regards

Helen Rose

Security Team

GRO

Mobile:

GRO

Mobex:

GRO

From: Helen Rose
Sent: 22 August 2012 10:08
To: Jarnail A Singh
Subject: RE: Horizon

Thanks Jarnail

I have now included an updated draft (v2) which both includes a section on defence requests and the working spreadsheet.

Moving forward this should be easier to complete in more detail as I will now (hopefully) be aware of cases as they are happening and have more understanding of the requests being made.

I have also been able to locate the Jo Hamilton case (back in 2005) and this is now included on the working spreadsheet.

regards

Helen Rose

Security Team

GRO

Mobile:

GRO

Mobex:

GRO

From: Jarnail A Singh
Sent: 22 August 2012 09:19
To: Helen Rose
Subject: RE: Horizon

Thanks Helen both would be useful with detail note capture this is vital.
Jarnail

From: Helen Rose
Sent: 22 August 2012 08:16
To: Jarnail A Singh
Subject: RE: Horizon

Jarnail

Looking at the data I have access to, the main challenge as you know was the Misra case. The others seem to be asking general questions around specific areas of the individual cases. i.e. if the loss has been hidden in cheques then they want to know the process of cheques entering on horizon, despatching, accounting for etc. if the loss was in remittances then details are asked around this process. Newsome (Dhale) wanted full disclosure on previous cases where there was criticism of the horizon system but this wasn't challenged at a trial. Training issues appear to be mentioned regular.

I would summarise that the main questions in this area are: - training, accounting procedures, request for fujitsu logs. But usually the claim is "it's the horizon system" with nothing specific being pointed at and previous cases are usually mentioned.

So I would agree that "the defence solicitors are making similar disclosure requests meaning disclosure requests made in the past is what likely requests will be in the future".

Do you want me to include a paragraph like this in the report or would it be of more use including another column in the working sheet to list things requested by defence?

regards

Helen Rose

Security Team

GRO

Mobile:

GRO

Mobex:

GRO

From: Jarnail A Singh
Sent: 21 August 2012 10:33
To: Helen Rose
Subject: Horizon

Helen

I refer you to my email 26th July as follows;

“Also We are particularly interested in defence expert reports, any defence statements requesting operating data for Horizon ,are defence solicitors making similar disclosure requests meaning disclosure requests made in the past is what is likely requests in the future”.

Are you able to make comment on this.

Regards

Jarnail

This email and any attachments are confidential and intended for the addressee only. If you are not the named recipient, you must not use, disclose, reproduce, copy or distribute the contents of this communication. If you have received this in error, please contact the sender and then delete this email from your system.

ROYAL MAIL GROUP LIMITED registered in England and Wales at 100 VICTORIA EMBANKMENT, LONDON EC4Y 0HQ with the registered company number 04138203

POST OFFICE LIMITED registered in England and Wales at 148 OLD STREET, LONDON EC1V 9HQ with the registered company number 02154540

This email and any attachments are confidential and intended for the addressee only. If you are not the named recipient, you must not use, disclose, reproduce, copy or distribute the contents of this communication. If you have received this in error, please contact the sender and then delete this email from your system.

ROYAL MAIL GROUP LIMITED registered in England and Wales at 100 VICTORIA EMBANKMENT, LONDON EC4Y 0HQ with the registered company number 04138203

POST OFFICE LIMITED registered in England and Wales at 148 OLD STREET, LONDON EC1V 9HQ with the registered company number 02154540
