M	es	sa	g	е
---	----	----	---	---

From: Sharron L Jennings GRO on behalf of Sharron L Jennings Sent: 03/10/2012 13:15:02 To: Helen Rose **GRO** Helen Dickinson CC: GRO ; Andy Hayward FW: HORIZON FUJITSU REPORT VERY URGENT Subject:

Hi all

FYI only. Please do not forward this on any further as it is merely a draft at present and we want to ensure consistency with all Horizon Integrity cases.

Regards

Sharron Jennings

Post Office Limited Security Manager Midway House Admin Section 1 Elliott Way Birmingham B6 7AP





Attachments: ARCGENREPxxxx HorizonIntegrity (HB).doc

Confidential Information: This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient (s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.

Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail

From: martin smith GRO

Sent: 03 October 2012 13:19 **To:** Sharron L Jennings

Subject: FW: HORIZON FUJITSU REPORT VERY URGENT

FYI

From: Harry Bowyer

Sent: 02 October 2012 13:41

To: martin smith **Cc:** Andy Cash

Subject: RE: HORIZON FUJITSU REPORT VERY URGENT

Martin,

At first sight this/these look like a good base upon which our reports can be based (As most are fishing expeditions they will do in their current form.)

I have edited the last report (last paragraph) because as it currently stands it is an invitation for requests for further disclosure. (See attachment) Can you put this past Mr Jenkins.

Can you draft generic s9 statements for the witness to produce the report(s). This must set out his expertise to comment on the system both the old and the new - we have to establish his right to speak as an expert.

I am in favour of the descriptive words being added to the diagram (but in simple language please) as these may have to be explained to a jury (and prosecution counsel).

Beyond that keep it simple - the secret here will be to respond to the defence expert report rather than try to anticipate every rock to be thrown at us - unless they be obvious from the defence statement/interviews.

If there is a specific challenge in a case then the statement and the report can be tweaked to cover the eventuality.

My view is that most challenges to the horizon system should now vanish away before the trial.

Any problems let me know.

Harry

From: martin smith

Sent: 02 October 2012 10:34

To: 'William Martin'

Cc: Harry Bowyer; Andy Cash; Rachael Panter

Subject: FW: HORIZON FUJITSU REPORT VERY URGENT

Dear all,

Please see below an e-mail which I have just received from Gareth Jenkins, the Fujitsu expert.

Martin.

From: Jenkins Gareth GI

GRO

Sent: 02 October 2012 09:59

To: Jarnail A Singh

Cc: Thomas Penny; Hugh Flemington; martin smith; Davidson James; Phillips Edward

Subject: RE: HORIZON FUJITSU REPORT VERY URGENT

Jarnail,

I've put together the attached report as requested.

Hopefully it covers what you need. If you think there are areas that need expanding / changing then please let me know. In parallel I will register the document in our Document Management system so it has a formal reference.

A couple of specific questions:

- 1. I've marked the document as "Legally privileged". Is that OK? I'm told that there is no point if it is to be disclosed.
- 2. Are you part of Post Office Ltd or Royal Mail Group?
- 3. Are the diagrams in section 2.3 sufficient or do I need to add some descriptive words? There is a more detailed description in the referenced documents.

I also attach a copy of my Witness Statement for the West Byfleet case as this is referenced in the document and has mush of the detailed refutations. I decided it was clearer to leave this as a referenced document rather than cutting and pasting the relevant sections into the new report.

You should already have copies of the other referenced documents.

Regards

Gareth

Gareth Jenkins Distinguished Engineer Business Applications Architect Post Office Account

FUJITSU

Lovelace Road, Bracknell, Berkshire, RG12 8SN

Tel: Mobile: email: Web:

GRO

http://uk.fujitsu.com



Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this email?

From: Jenkins Gareth GI Sent: 01 October 2012 15:10

To: 'Jarnail A Singh'

Cc: Thomas Penny; Hugh Flemington; martin smith; Davidson James; Phillips Edward

Subject: RE: HORIZON FUJITSU REPORT VERY URGENT

Dear Jarnail,

Attached are the two existing reports I mentions regarding Horizon and Horizon Online Integrity.

I'll try and produce a further short report addressing your specific points below in the next few days.

Hopefully that will cover off your requirements.

Regards

Gareth

Gareth Jenkins Distinguished Engineer Business Applications Architect Post Office Account FUJITSU
Lovelace Road, Bracknell, Berkshire, RG12 8SN

Tel:
Mobile:
email:
Web:
http://uk.fujitsu.com



Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this email?

From: Jarnail A Singh GRO

Sent: 01 October 2012 12:05

To: Jenkins Gareth GI

Cc: Thomas Penny; Hugh Flemington; martin smith **Subject:** HORIZON FUJITSU REPORT VERY URGENT

Dear Mr Jenkins

Welcome from your annual leave and your assistance advice in the past prosecution cases and I understand you are assisting my colleagues at present. I need your urgent assist judge has this morning ordered the prosecution to have the following report ready to be served within Seven days. On advise Post Office Limited have appointed one of their investigators, Helen Rose as disclosure officer dealing with Horizon challenges. She has prepared a document/ spread sheet detailing all such cases, past and present, approximately 20 in total, although none thus far successfully argued in court. Post Office limited have been advised to obtain, an experts report from Fujitsu UK, the Horizon system developers, confirming the system is robust. Post Office Limited maintain the system is robust, but in light of adverse publicity, from legal viewpoint is that defence should be given opportunity to test the system, should they still wish to do so, on consideration of our report.

You will need to consider the Disclosure officers document/spread sheet(see attachments) and need to address in your report the following issues:

- 1) A description of the horizon system (In laymen's' terms so that a jury can understand what it is and what it does)
- 2) A declaration that it has yet to be attacked successfully.
- 3) A summary of the basic attacks made on the system concentrating on any expert reports served in past cases. If there are none then state that no expert has yet been found by any defence team civil or criminal to attack the system. (at the moment there seems to be little more than griping by defendants that the system must be at fault without saying how)
- 4) Plainly, like all accounting systems, there is room for human error (Keying in wrong amounts etc) are you able to state that innocent human error is unlikely to produce the types of discrepancies of many thousands of pounds over many months.

If you require any further information or wish to discuss please do not hesitate to contact me. Regards

Jarnail Singh

prosecution Lawyer GRO

POL-0096580

This email and any attachments are confidential and intended for the addressee only. If you are not the named recipient, you must not use, disclose, reproduce, copy or distribute the contents of this communication. If you have received this in error, please contact the sender and then delete this email from your system.

ROYAL MAIL GROUP LIMITED registered in England and Wales at 100 VICTORIA EMBANKMENT, LONDON EC4Y 0HQ with the registered company number 04138203

POST OFFICE LIMITED registered in England and Wales at 148 OLD STREET, LONDON EC1V 9HQ with the registered company number 02154540

Unless otherwise stated, this email has been sent from Fujitsu Services Limited, from Fujitsu (FTS) Limited, or from Fujitsu Telecommunications Europe Limited, together "Fujitsu".

This email is only for the use of its intended recipient. Its contents are subject to a duty of confidence and may be privileged. Fujitsu does not guarantee that this email has not been intercepted and amended or that it is virus-free.

Fujitsu Services Limited, registered in England No 96056, registered office 22 Baker Street, London W1U 3BW.

Fujitsu (FTS) Limited, registered in England No 03808613, registered office 22 Baker Street, London W1U 3BW.

PFU Imaging Solutions Europe Limited, registered in England No 1578652, registered office Hayes Park Central, Hayes End Road, Hayes, Middlesex, UB4 8FE.

Fujitsu Telecommunications Europe Limited, registered in England No 2548187, registered office Solihull Parkway, Birmingham Business Park, Birmingham, B37 7YU.