
From: Barbara Bennett[/O=MMS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BARBARA.BENNETT2D3EEF43-4806-4603-9601-A44091049180]
Sent: Thur 22/07/2010 1:52:08 PM (UTC)
To: Michele Graves [GRO]
Subject: FW: Very Urgent - Challenges to Horizon

From: Lynn Hobbs
Sent: 22 July 2010 14:51
To: Sue Huggins; Nick Beal; Philippa J Wright
Cc: Paul Budd; Mike Granville
Subject: Very Urgent - Challenges to Horizon

Sue, Nick, Philippa

Here is the info referred to in my previous email from Sue Lowther in Information Security

Lynn

From: Sue Lowther
Sent: 22 July 2010 13:48
To: Lynn Hobbs
Subject: FW: Challenges to Horizon

Lynn,

I have been trying to send some information to Dave Pardoe re Integrity to Horizon but he maintains he has not received them and asked me to send directly to yourself.

Should you have any queries or require information both Dave King and I are in 148 Old St. with Fujitsu Information Security at the moment, so please contact us on Dave Kings number [GRO]

Yours
Sue.

From: Sue Lowther
Sent: 22 July 2010 13:25
To: Dave Pardoe
Subject: FW: Challenges to Horizon

From: Sue Lowther
Sent: 22 July 2010 12:45
To: Dave Pardoe; Andy Hayward
Subject: FW: Challenges to Horizon

Dave,

I think the email trail below will be of interest.

I wanted to do an internal check across all the finance systems as well as Horizon but the feelings of the Lawyers was 'negative' at first, also there were no 'trends' in the information we had.

Sue

From: sue.lowther [GRO]
Sent: 03 March 2010 22:13
To: paul.halliden [GRO]
Subject: Fw: Challenges to Horizon

I would have thought keeping it internal would ensure that we are merely responding to challenges to check there is no validity. Any suggestions how we respond to below!!

Sue.

Susan L Lowther
Information Security
Tel [GRO]

----- Laptop Security -Leash it, don't lose it - its your responsibility! ----

----- Forwarded by Sue Lowther/e/POSTOFFICE on 03/03/2010 22:11 -----

Rob G Wilson

To: Dave Posnett/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE, Doug Evans/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE

cc: Andy Hayward/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE, Dave M King/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE, Mandy

03/03/2010 11:23 Talbot/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE, Rebekah Mantle/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE, Rod Ismay/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE, Sue Lowther/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE

Subject: Re: Fw: Challenges to Horizon [Link](#)

Dave,

If it is thought that there is a difficulty with Horizon then clearly the action set out in your memo is not only needed but is imperative. The consequence however will be that to commence or continue to proceed with any criminal proceedings will be inappropriate. My understanding is that the integrity of Horizon data is sound and it is as a result of this that persistent challenges that have been made in court have always failed. These challenges are not new and have been with us since the inception of Horizon as it has always been the only way that Defendants are left to challenge our evidence when they have stolen money or where they need to show that our figures are not correct.

What is being suggested is that an internal investigation is conducted. Such an investigation will be disclosable as undermining evidence on the defence in the cases proceeding through the criminal courts. Inevitably the defence will argue that if we are carrying out an investigation we clearly do not have confidence in Horizon and therefore to continue to prosecute will be an abuse of the criminal process. Alternatively we could be asked to stay the proceedings pending the outcome of the investigation, if this were to be adopted the resultant adverse publicity could lead to massive difficulties for POL as it would be seen by the press and media to vindicate the current challenges. The potential impact however is much wider for POL in that every office in the country will be seen to be operating a compromised system with untold damage to the Business. Our only real alternative to avoid the adverse publicity will be to offer no evidence on each of our criminal cases. This should mitigate some adverse publicity but is not a total guarantee.

To continue prosecuting alleged offenders knowing that there is an ongoing investigation to determine the veracity of Horizon could also be detrimental to the reputation of my team. If we were to secure convictions in the knowledge that there was an investigation, where the investigation established a difficulty with the system we would be open to criticism and appeal to the Court of Appeal. The Court of Appeal will inevitably be highly critical of any prosecutor's decision to proceed against Defendant's in the knowledge that there could be an issue with the evidence.

What we really need to do is impress on Fujitsu the importance of fully cooperating in the provision of technical expertise and witness statements to support the criminal and civil litigation now and in the future.

Given the nature of the discussions that took place on the 26/2 I am staggered that I was not invited to take part in the conference.

Rob Wilson
Head of Criminal Law

Tel: GRO
Mobile: GRO

Dave Posnett

To: Mandy Talbot/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE, Rod Ismay/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE, Rebekah
Mantle/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE, Dave M King/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE, Sue Lowther/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE, Andy
01/03/2010 Hayward/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE
17:02
cc: Rob G Wilson/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE
Subject: Fw: Challenges to Horizon

All,

Can we please ensure that Rob Wilson (Head Of Criminal Law, RMG) is kept apprised of the situation and included in any further meetings/updates on this subject. Our prosecution cases have faced an increase in challenges as well as our civil cases, so the activities outlined below, and indeed going forward, are applicable to both Legal teams.

Regards,

Dave Posnett
Fraud Risk Manager

Security Suite (G14), Leatherhead DO, Station Rd, Leatherhead, KT22 7AE
GRO Mobex: GRO
GRO
GRO Post-line: GRO Fax: GRO



----- Forwarded by Andy Hayward/e/POSTOFFICE on 26/02/2010 17:35 -----

Andy Hayward

To: Mandy Talbot/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE, Rod Ismay/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE, Rebekah
26/02/2010 Mantle/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE, Dave M King/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE, Sue Lowther/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE
17:01 cc: David X Smith/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE, John M Scott/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE, Iain
Murphy/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE, Dave Posnett/e/POSTOFFICE@POSTOFFICE
Subject: Challenges to Horizon

All,
following our conference call today, below is a brief summary of the agreed key activities to progress the next steps in relation to the above piece of work:

- 1) AH & MT to provide SL/DK with information on past and present cases with reference to the Horizon Challenges (Criminal & Civil cases).
(*Note: I have asked the fraud team to review approx. past 2-3 years casefile although these challenges are of a more

recent nature).

2) Information Security (SL &DK) to conduct initial investigations and provide Terms of Reference outlining remit and requirements to carry out full investigation (inc. resource, timescales and any associated ancillary costs). (N.B. agreement by all that with DK and our 'banking consultant' (Paul Hallidan), we have far more expertise and knowledge than anyone else is likely to produce for this initial piece of work).

3) Subject to agreement of 2 above, conduct full investigations into integrity issues, with conclusions/ report provided. Once investigated and conclusions drawn, gain external verification to give a level of ' external gravitas' to the response to these challenges. (Recommend Ernst & Young as most suitable partner to complete this...TBA).

Additional:

AP: DP to continue with investigation into Alresford (outstanding debt) case and feed into MT & wider review.

AP: DP to forward details to all on previous investigations conducted on 2 x Horizon challenge cases.

Note: Ensure that any response formulated includes an ongoing review to any developments/Changes to Horizon, that in turn will support legal challenges in the future. (DK commented that there were already systems in place that would verify and support this).

Dave S/ John S

If there is anything else you wish to comment or add please advise.

As I am away next week could I ask that you direct any immediate responses via Dave Posnett please.

Mandy Talbot (MT) Rod Ismay (RI)

Thanks in advance,

Dave king (DK)

Rebakah Mantle (RM)

Sue Lowther (SL) Dave

Posnett (DP)

Andy

Andy Hayward (AH)

Regards,

Andy Hayward

Senior Fraud Risk Programme Manager

Post Office Ltd. Security Team

☎ (m) **GRO** / **GRO** (Mobex)
☎ **GRO**



Confidential Information: This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient (s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.



Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail