

Simon Hi is that Gareth Jenkins.

Gareth It is indeed.

Simon Oh hi Gareth it's Simon Clarke I'm a Barrister prosecuting a case for Jarnail on Monday at Birmingham Crown Court.

Gareth Right,

Simon Jarnail suggested that we give you a call because we've heard that the Insight Committee Report is due to go before MPs next week I think I don't know if you have heard the same thing, have you?

Gareth 8<sup>th</sup> July is the date I have been told.

Simon I beg your pardon.

Gareth 8<sup>th</sup> July I have been told.

Simon Oh, is it the 8<sup>th</sup> of July, ok that's fine. Well I don't suppose you know anything about the case of Samra the Hurst Lane Birmingham Post Office do you?

Gareth No that's not one I have been asked to provide any statements for before I know nothing about it I'm afraid.

Simon Ok, well can I give you a brief sort of thumbnail sketch. Basically this is a Post Mistress who is alleged to have made double transaction withdrawals from Horizon when people have come in and taken money out on their Post Office card accounts. Do you follow?

Gareth Yes I think I've heard about that sort of scam going on yes.

Simon Yes, and essentially what she is doing she is asking them to put their pin number in a second time claiming that it hasn't worked the first time and accordingly then taking the money out herself.

Gareth Yep.

Simon All of and I mean all of the evidence we have got against her is Horizon data evidence.

Gareth Yep.

Simon And when I say that what I mean is that all the transactions are conducted over the counter through Horizon.

Gareth Yep

Simon I don't know if you know that the accounts themselves are maintained by Hewlett Packard who provide the data processing facilities that send out the bank statements but all of their information of course is derived directly from Horizon transactions back at the branch yeah.

Gareth Yes I understand that. Yep.

Simon Ok. The problem I have got is that we are not allowed to see the Report but we are told that there are up to 30 offices where bugs have been identified, yeah, and we know that Hurst Lane is not one of the branches where there has been an identified bug. Still with us?

Gareth Erm right as I say certainly I am aware of 2 bugs. Is it. Firstly is this something that has been done on Horizon on the new Horizon system or the old system.

Simon It's the

Gareth What's the date.

Simon It's Horizon Online.

Gareth Ok right. So there is 2 bugs that we have declared to Second Site in that sort of area erm and erm we know exactly which branches are affected and they wouldn't have any impact whatsoever on that part of err what's going on erm and I think we've, we are confident that the audit trail that you are using for prosecution has not been compromised by those bugs.

Simon Right Ok. So what I'm looking for then ... That's helpful. What I'm looking for then because I have to consider whether or not we need to disclose this information to the defence or even stop the trial as you will understand.

Gareth Yeah.

Simon           What I'm looking for is confirmation effectively that you have given so can I ask you a couple of questions which may prompt yes or no answers?

Gareth          Sure.

Simon           Erm as far as the data that the transactions conducted over Horizon which involve the withdrawal of sums of cash from Post Office card accounts, is there any reason to believe that Horizon can be, can slip into error?

Gareth          Not that I'm aware of.

Simon           Ok and has there been any evidence or hint or suggestion from anybody or any complaint from anybody that that might be the case?

Gareth          No.

Simon           Ok. Erm, where are we going from here. What's the questions I posed earlier. Sorry I've got Martin Smith here with me as well, he's the Solicitor in the case.

Gareth          I know Martin.

Martin          Hi Gareth.

Gareth          Hi.

Martin          Hi. It's the Horizon system is functioning perfectly.....

Simon           This is the other point. Bugs have been identified in Horizon which call into question some of the aspects of the way in which is operates. That's a fair assessment isn't it?

Gareth          Erm yes.

Simon           Yep. Ok. How can we be sure that (a) we have identified all of the bugs that there are and (b) that although Horizon has been demonstrated that to be fallible that in so far as the case we are conducting is concerned we can eliminate the possibility of error.

Gareth          Right I mean clearly we can't you can never say there are no more bugs in the system so we've got to be careful about trying to say anything like that but what we can show is that nothing

has been found to show that there is a problem in the integrity of the audit trail which is what has been used for the erm erm your evidence.

Simon So your view is that erm that if the defence were to suggest erm there is a problem with Horizon and therefore we can't rule out that there might be other problems with Horizon what you say is as far as you're concerned the integrity of the system is intact.

Gareth Yes.

Simon That's very very helpful. Thank you. Martin over to you.

Martin Thank you for that Gareth I think that's answered a number of questions that we had. I'm grateful for the time you have taken to talk to us.

Gareth Ok, no problem. Good luck.

Martin Thank you Gareth.

Gareth Cheers, bye